

Hafrashas Challah

Combining Batches Cont. *Part 4*

Rav Moshe Kaufman

The Poskim deliberate about combining doughs/baked goods in different scenarios:

SEPARATE WRAPPINGS

Although keeping breads in different closed bags may prevent them from combining to a shiur that requires a hafrashah, R. Moshe Feinstein zt"l and others maintain that cellophane wrappings around bread or cake is not like separate utensils, and if those breads are placed together into one big utensil they will combine for a shiur challah (Mesores Moshe Vol. 5 YD 205, see Derech Emunah, SSK ibid).

OVENS

The gemara (Pesachim 47b) brings a dispute if an oven can combine different doughs into one shiur for hafrashas challah. The gemara does not explain why an oven is different from a kli. Some suggest that in the times of chazal the ovens were attached to the ground (Challas Lechem 4:21). Others explain that an oven is not a genuine kli for it is always open on the top, and never fully enclosed (Daas Kedoshim 325). Lehalachah, the Rambam (6:16) rules that it does not combine to create a shiur. The Bais Yosef follows the Rambam to be lenient in chutz la'aretz where hafrashas challah can never be more than a derabbanan. In fact, the idea of tziruf in an oven is not mentioned in the Shulchan Aruch. However, several Rishonim (Ramban Hilchos Challah, Teshuvos HaRashbah 1:461 and others) argue that an oven is in fact metzaref to create a shiur.

Lehalachah, the Gr"a (YD 325:3) and Pri Chadash (OC 457:1) rule that an oven is not metztaref at all, yet the Kaf Hachaim (457:22) and Maharsham write that in Eretz Yisroel, where the rules of challah are more stringent, one should be machmir (see Machzeh Eliyahu Vol 1 110). Even so, R. Moshe Feinstein zt"l and others (Mesores Moshe Vol. 5 YD 205, Ohalei Yeshurun note 56, see Chelkas Binyomin ibid 19) maintained the above reasons for an oven not being a kli may not apply to our

ovens, for they are not part of the ground, and is closed on all sides. Therefore, one in this situation should be mafrish without a berachah.

FREEZERS

Poskim discuss if a freezer is considered a utensil to combine various batches. If so, one who puts small batches of dough, or baked items from different small batches into the freezer, it would create an obligation of hafrashas challah. Talmidim of R. Moshe Feinstein zt"l (ibid.) relate that different doughs/bread placed in a freezer, will combine to create a shiur, just like an oven (see above). However, other poskim rule that a big freezer larger than 40 sa'ah cannot combine to a shiur, for it is too big to be considered a utensil (DE 6:138). Poskim add a consideration, that in order to combine various batches to a shiur, there needs to be intention for them to be combined, as opposed to a freezer, which a storage place, and not meant to combine different items together (see DE 6:16 Biur Halachah "VeEin"). R. Shlomo Zalman Auerbach zt"l rules that one should be mafrish without a berachah (SSK 42:end 39). If one puts each dough/baked item into its own sealed bag, there is more reason to be lenient (Machazeh Eliyahu 113).

MUKAF

When one is mafrish challah, all of the dough being covered by this hafrasha, must be "together" at the time of the hafrashah (SA YD 323:1). This is referred to as mukaf. While this is an imperative in Eretz Yisroel, in chutz la'aretz it is less so. As discussed elsewhere (MBH article #131), one may eat from bread made in chutz la'aretz, even before the hafrashah is done. Certainly, what was eaten before the hafrashah will not be mukaf. Even so, the Taz (OC 457:2) and Magen Avraham (4) write that l'chatchila the doughs should be mukaf even in chutz la'aretz. In cases where the items were already dispersed, or it is right before Shabbos, one may take off without it being mukaf.

However, the Rema (YD 323:1) adds that in chutz la'aretz the leniency for mukaf is only when there was one batch of dough that got split up into smaller pieces. In the case of separate batches, one should not take off from one batch for the other unless they are mukaf, in close proximity of each other.

What is considered "mukaf"? If each batch has its own shiur for hafrashas challah, and one hafrashah is being done for all of the dough, it will be considered mukaf if they are in the same room; they need not touch each other (MB 457:7, Dirshu citing Derech Emunah Terumos 3:153). However, this is if they are sitting out of a kli. If

each dough is in a separate bowl, the bowls should at least be touching each other, as well as open on the top (Gra ibid, Derech Emunah ibid 155).

When 2 separate doughs are combined to create a shiur for hafrashah, there is a machlokes haposkim about the need for mukaf. Some suggest that it should be viewed as one dough, and one may take off from one of the doughs and have in mind the others, even if they are not in the same room (Taz OC 457:2, Mikor Chaim 5, Chachmas Adam 14:5). Others argue that even when combining them, it is still not exactly like one dough, and mukaf is necessary (Chok Yaakov 6). The Mishnah Berurah (457:6) and Aruch HaShulchan (8) follow the latter view, therefore one should be machmir (SS"K 31 note 35).

A classic example is where everything was baked before doing a hafrashah, and some of the items were put away in the downstairs freezer. If it all came from one dough, one may perform the hafrashah on the part in front of him, having in mind to cover the items elsewhere in the house. If they came from 2 separate doughs, one would need to bring up the other items, so that all the doughs are "together" before performing a hafrashah on one dough for all the others.

IS ONE ALLOWED TO MAKE SEPARATE SMALL BATCHES OF DOUGH TO AVOID HAFRASHAS CHALLAH?

The Shulchan Aruch (YD 324:14, from Pesachim 46a) teaches that one may not deliberately make small batches, less than the required shiur, to avoid having to perform hafrashas challah. However, when there is a compelling reason to do so, such as to avoid issues of tuma'ah, one may make smaller batches. One common example is when a recipe specially calls for small batches of dough. Although one will be making a number of doughs that equal to a shiur for hafrashah, it is not viewed as trying to avoid the mitzvah. This is common with sourdough, which are often made in very specific sized recipes.

Even so, one should keep in mind that one of the primary reasons for women baking challah each week, especially Erev Shabbos, is to fulfill the mitzvah of hafrashas challah (see Magen Avraham 242:4, MB 6). Therefore, one should seek a halachic solution of how to combine the different batches to be able to perform hafrashas challah.

BELILAH RACCAH (BATTER)

The Shulchan Aruch (YD 229:2) rules that if a batter, which is merely a liquid substance and not a dough at all, is baked into a bread product, like a pancake (made with minimal oil), hafrashas challah is required. Although it is not dough in the beginning, since it

becomes bread product afterward, it gets the status of lechem. However, since it only achieves the status of bread upon the baking, many poskim state that one should only be mafrish challah after it is baked (Minchas Shlomo 1:68, Shevet Halevi 8:242 and others). However, R. Moshe Feinstein zt"l is quoted by talmidim that the hafrashah may be done at any point of the process (Mesores Moshe Vol 3 YD, Dayan Fuerst shlit"a, see Avnei Nezer YD 413). Some even require doing hafrashah twice, once before the baking, and again after the baking (Minchas Yitzchok, see Teshuvos VeHanhagos 3:334). Since it is a machlokes, a beracha should only be recited when the hafrashah is done after the baking (Derech Emunah 6:105, nt 224).

As was stated, hafrashas challah is only performed with a beracha when the dough/bread contains 5 pounds of flour. It is rare to have one liquid batter with so much flour in it. In addition, the batter is usually divided between numerous pans, and would need something to combine them together to create a shiur for hafrashah. Therefore, nearly every time hafrashah is done from a belilah raccah, it is without a beracha. (See Mesores Moshe Vol. 1 YD 322 and 2 YD 234).

[Whether it has the status of bread is also relevant to the halachos of berachos. If something like pancakes is in fact bread, one who is "kovea seudah" on it, meaning they eat the amount of a regular meal, would need to wash, recite hamotzie and birchas hamazon.]

CAKES

The Pischei Teshuvah (329:2) quotes the Panim Meiros who protests against those who do not take challah from their cakes etc. The Aruch HaShulchan (YD 329:6/14) tries to defend this practice and writes that hafrashas challah is only for dough that becomes real bread. Any cakes etc. would not fit the criteria. However, this view is not found in any of the earlier rishonim or achronim, and is rejected by all poskim. As such, a hafrashah is required from the dough of any baked goods (see Minchas Shlomo 1:68, Machzeh Eliyahu 110). While people are usually conscious of making a hafrashah from dough used for bread, people are less aware of the similar obligation when baking rugalach, cookies, or kuchan cake. Perhaps it is because a hafrashah is only performed if the dough contains at least 2.5lb of flour (without a beracha, and a beracha if it has 5lb of flour), and people usually bake these items in small quantities, below the threshold to require a hafrashah. Whatever the reason, the halacha clearly states that hafrashas challah is required from any dough of the 5 grains, even if other ingredients are added, and it is baked into cake or cookies. If the dough contains enough flour, the hafrashah is done with a beracha.



HAVE A SHAILA?

Contact the
Midwest Bais
Horaah

CALL 773.539.4141
EMAIL mbhshailos@gmail.com



Another
project of
Agudath
Israel of
Illinois